Pursuant to the Court's Individual Rule I.D.3, any party or non-party having an interest in maintaining under seal any of the material redacted or filed under seal shall file a letter in support of that position by **November 23, 2022**.

Plaintiffs shall serve a copy of this Order on third parties Mitchell and J.D. Power by **November 21, 2022**.

So Ordered.

Dated: November 18, 2022 New York, New York

LORNA G. SCHOFIELD
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Re: Volino, et. al. v. Progressive Casualty Ins. Co., et al., No. 1:21-cv-06243-LGS

Dear Judge Schofield:

Pursuant to Rule I.D.3 of the Court's Individual Rules of Practice, and the Stipulated Protective Order entered on October 21, 2021, (ECF No. 45), as amended on January 25, 2022 (ECF No. 77), Plaintiffs respectfully request leave to file under seal Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification; portions of the Declaration and Expert Report of Jason Merritt; and Exhibits 1-2 & 4-12 to the Declaration of Hank Bates. The Motion and supporting materials reference and discuss information that Defendants Progressive Advanced Insurance Company ("PAIC"), Progressive Max Insurance Company ("PMIC"), Progressive Specialty Insurance Company ("PSIC"), and Progressive Casualty Insurance Company ("PCIC") (collectively "Defendants") have designated as confidential, as well as information that third parties Mitchell International, Inc. ("Mitchell") and J.D. Power have designated as confidential or highly confidential.

Pursuant to Rule I.D.3, and paragraph ten of the Stipulated Protective Order, a redacted copy of the Motion will be publicly filed contemporaneously with this letter, along with a copy of the unredacted Motion and supporting materials with highlighted redactions under seal.

Plaintiffs are redacting portions of the Motion and supporting materials to comply with their obligations under the Stipulated Protective Order. These redactions do not reflect Plaintiffs' position on whether those designations should stand under Second Circuit law.

Counsel for Plaintiffs conferred with Defendants' counsel and counsel for Mitchell and J.D. Power, all of whom agreed that their clients' confidential documents and information should be filed under seal.

Respectfully submitted,

Hank Bates

cc: All Counsel of Record via ECF

## APPENDIX 1

Pursuant to Rule I.D(3), the following attorneys of record should have access to the sealed letter-motion requesting a premotion conference on Plaintiffs' motion for class certification:

Counsel for Plaintiffs	Counsel for Defendants
Jacob L. Phillips ( <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> )	Laura Elizabeth Harris
NORMAND PLLC	KING & SPALDING LLP
3165 McCrory Place, Suite 175	1185 Avenue of the Americas
Orlando, FL 32803	New York, NY 10036
Telephone: (407) 603-6031	Telephone: (212) 790-5360
Email: jacob.phillips@normandpllc.com	Fax: (212) 556-2222
Email: ean@normandpllc.com	Email: <u>lharris@kslaw.com</u>
Hank Bates (Pro Hac Vice)	Jeffrey Cashdan ( <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> )
Tiffany Wyatt Oldham (Pro Hac Vice)	Allison Hill White ( <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> )
Lee Lowther (Pro Hac Vice)	James Matthew Brigman (Pro Hac Vice)
Jake G. Windley (Pro Hac Vice)	Zachary Andrew McEntyre ( <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> )
CARNEY BATES & PULLIAM, PLLC	KING & SPALDING LLP
519 W. 7th Street	1180 Peachtree Street NE, Suite 1700
Little Rock, AR 72201	Atlanta, GA 30309
Telephone: (501) 312-8500	Telephone: (404) 572-5600
Email: <a href="mailto:hbates@cbplaw.com">hbates@cbplaw.com</a>	Email: jcashdan@kslaw.com
Email: toldham@cbplaw.com	Email: awhite@kslaw.com
Email: <u>llowther@cbplaw.com</u>	Email: mbrigman@kslaw.com
Email: jwindley@cbplaw.com	Email: <u>zmcentyre@kslaw.com</u>
Mariam Grigorian (Pro Hac Vice)	Julia Constance Barrett (Pro Hac Vice)
SHAMIS & GENTILE, P.A.	KING & SPALDING LLP
14 NE 1st Avenue, Suite 705	500 W. 2nd Street, Suite 1800
Miami, FL 33132	Austin, TX 78701
Telephone: (305) 479-2299	Telephone: (512) 457-2053
Email: mgrigorian@shamisgentile.com	Email: jbarrett@kslaw.com
Scott Adam Edelsberg (Pro Hac Vice)	
Christopher Chagas Gold ( <i>Pro Hac Vice</i> )	
EDELSBERG LAW	
20900 NE 30th Avenue, Suite 417	
Aventura, FL 33180	
Telephone: (305) 975-3320	
Email: scott@edelsberglaw.com	
Email: chris@edelsberglaw.com	
<del>-</del>	

Thomas M. Mullaney LAW OFFICES OF THOMAS M. **MULLANEY** 530 Fifth Avenue, 23rd Floor

New York, NY 10036 Telephone: (212) 223-0800 Fax: (212) 661-9860

Email: Mulllaw@msn.com